

Peer review day

MAT2000 February 18, 2026

Today

- In groups of 2-3
- Read manuscript (15-20 min)
 - Checklist
 - Post it/margin notes
- Give feedback (10-15 min)
- 25-30 minutes for each project

Read manuscript (15-20 min)

First reading

- Read the text quickly
- What is the text about?
 - Write one sentence on a post it note
- Checklist
 - TEMPLATE
 - Title
 - Abstract
 - Introduction
 - Acknowledgements*
 - Topic presentation
 - Notation
 - Figure with caption
 - Clickable cross references
 - Clickable citations
 - Reference list
 - Short plan for the project

Second reading

- Write one sentence or keywords summing up the content in the margin outside each paragraph
- Note where you need more (or less) help as a reader
 - Text
 - Layout
- Mark obvious mistakes with a pen
 - Typos
 - Punctuation
 - Notation
 - Consistency

You will read your own draft too!

Feedback on manuscript (10-15 min)

First

- What is the text about?
 - Compare post it notes
 - Summarise the text in your own words
- Is there anything on the checklist that needs to be commented?

Second

- Discuss sentences in the margin
 - Do you agree?
 - Storytelling?
 - Structure differently?
- Give two stars and a wish

How to make feedback constructive?

Giving

- Ethical guidelines for reviewers
- Show respect for the writer
- What you are looking at is a draft, not a polished product
- Tell the writer what you as a reader don't understand
- Ask questions
- Be specific!
- Be constructive!

Receiving

- Share what you want feedback on!
- Thank the reviewer for the feedback
- Don't take it personally
- Grow with the feedback
- Improve draft with the feedback

Guidelines for discussion

- Show gratitude
 - For feedback and sharing of drafts. Note your reviewers names and list them in your acknowledgements section
- Acknowledge impact over intent
- Be constructive
- Listen mindfully
 - Don't prepare your response/defence while one is sharing
- Move up/step back
 - Give/take space for all to share opinions equitably
- Be aware of your ego
- Respect above all!

More tips for peer/self-review

- Ethical guidelines for reviewers
 - <https://publicationethics.org/sites/default/files/ethical-guidelines-peer-reviewers-cope.pdf>
- Wiley's «How to peer review»
 - <https://authorservices.wiley.com/Reviewers/journal-reviewers/how-to-perform-a-peer-review/index.html>
- From Terance Tao: (remove the «novelty checklist»)
 - <https://terrytao.wordpress.com/advice-on-writing-papers/submit-to-an-appropriate-journal/>