

FIGURE 2. Cultural map of the world.

Knack and Keefer (QJE 1997)

797) TABLE I TRUST, CIVIC COOPERATION, AND ECONOMIC PERFORMANCE, 1980–1992

Equation	1	2	3	4	5	6	7
Method	OLS	OLS	OLS	OLS	2SLS	OLS	OLS
Dependent variable		Growth 19	980–1992			Investm 1980	nent/GDP –1992
Constant	-0.935	-10.476	-9.593	-2.829	-1.037	9.617	-23.893
	(1.280)	(4.730)	(4.520)	(1.895)	(1.898)	(3.820)	(11.998)
GDP80	-0.361	-0.273	-0.375	0.152	-0.366	0.162	0.273
	(0.131)	(0.126)	(0.127)	(0.274)	(0.127)	(0.403)	(0.364)
PRIM60	6.192	5.930	7.061	4.818	6.270	11.655	13.030
	(1.051)	(1.164)	(1.224)	(1.709)	(1.759)	(3.558)	(3.274)
SEC60	2.194	3.457	1.648	1.256	2.085	-0.431	0.495
	(1.632)	(1.543)	(1.485)	(1.930)	(2.133)	(8.286)	(7.067)
PI80	-3.693	-3.117	-3.535	-3.930	-3.713	-4.435	-3.170
	(0.867)	(1.100)	(0.935)	(0.755)	(0.809)	(1.993)	(2.154)
TRUST	0.082		0.076	0.192	0.086	0.146	
	(0.030)		(0.030)	(0.060)	(0.039)	(0.078)	
CIVIC		0.272	0.207				0.872
		(0.098)	(0.092)				(0.301)
TRUST*GDP80		(,	(,	-0.013			(,
				(0.006)			
Adj. R ²	.55	.44	.56	.60	.52	.37	.38
SEE	1.37	1.52	1.35	1.29	1.37	4.43	4.38
Mean, D.V.	1.45	1.45	1.45	1.45	1.45	22.4	22.4

White [1980]-corrected standard errors are in parentheses. Instruments for TRUST in equation 5 include law students/total postsecondary students, Sullivan's homogeneity indicator, GDP80, SEC60, PRIM60, and PI80. Note that R^2 and SEE do not have their usual interpretations in 2SLS. R^2 's without social capital variables are .41 (growth) and .33 (inv/GDP). All equations have 29 observations.

	Trust							
Dependent variable	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	(7)	
Trust from 2000 WWS	0.55 (0.22)**						0.67 (0.21)***	
Constr. Exec. up to 1900		0.06 (0.02)***		0.06 (0.02)***	0.07 (0.02)**	0.05 (0.02)***	0.06 (0.01)***	
Polity2 up to 1900			0.05 (0.02)***		· · /	. ,		
Per capita income 1870				0.00 (0.08)				
Per capita income 1930				(,	-0.03	-0.16 (0.10)	-0.24 (0.08)***	
Primary school enr. 1910					()	0.52 (0.18)***	0.50 (0.16)***	
Observations Pseudo <i>R</i> ²	4267 0.08	4267 0.09	4267 0.08	3907 0.09	3907 0.09	3520 0.09	3520 0.10	

TABLE 4. Trust and ancestors' countries—probit estimates.

Notes: Robust standard errors in parentheses, clustered by country of origin of ancestors.

All regressions include the following controls: Gender; family income in constant dollar (base = 1986); dummy variables if completed high school, if completed college, if working, if unemployed, for age over 65, for age under 25, if married, for having at least one child, if Catholic, if Protestant, if Jewish, if father attended primary school, if mother attended primary school, if father attended college, if mother attended college, for living in urban area; number of grandparents born outside US; dummy variables for survey's decade (1980s, 1990s or after year 2000); dummy variables for metropolitan area or county of residence (258 dummies altogether).

	GADP & Bureaucratic quality						
Dependent variable	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)			
Trust	0.468 (0.218)**						
Respect		0.522 (0.263)*					
Trust & Respect		()	0.359 (0.144)**	0.279 (0.073)***			
Primary education in 1930	0.007 (0.001)***	0.007 (0.001)***	0.006 (0.001)***	0.000 (0.001)			
Income in 1980–2000				0.214 (0.033)***			
Observations	57	57	57	56			
Adjusted R^2	0.66	0.64	0.68	0.86			

TABLE 5. Culture and Governance, cross-country OLS estimates.

Notes: Robust standard errors in parentheses.

Other included covariates: Dummy variables for French and UK legal origin.

	Trust	Respect	Trust & Respect
Dependent variable	(1)	(2)	(3)
2nd person Differentiation	-0.22	-0.25	-0.24
-	(0.09)**	(0.04)***	(0.04)***
	(-0.06)	(-0.08)	
No pronoun drop	0.18	0.05	0.12
	(0.10)*	(0.07)	(0.06)**
	(0.05)	(0.02)	
Estimation	Probit	Probit	Ordered Probit
Observations	8640	8640	8640
Pseudo R^2	0.07	0.03	0.04

TABLE 6. Language and values inside countries, from individual respondents.

Notes: Robust standard errors in the first parentheses, clustered by country.

Marginal effects in the second parenthesis (estimated at the sample average for all variables).

Other covariates: dummy variables for gender, age (over 65 and under 25 years of age), being married, having no children. Country fixed effects and dummy variables for each wave are always included.

	GADP & Bureaucratic quality						
Dependent variable	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)			
Trust & Respect	0.57 (0.22)**	0.52 (0.21)**	0.60 (0.17)***	1.39 (0.39)***			
Also control for		Income in 1980–2000	Constraints on Executive 1960–2000	Settler's Mortality			
Observations	48	47	48	21			

TABLE 8. Values and Governance—2SLS estimates.

Notes: Robust standard errors in parentheses.

Instruments for Trust & Respect: Language.

Other covariates included in columns 1–3: Primary education in 1930, UK and French legal origin. Column 4 includes no other covariates.

Panel A. Transatlantic slave trade



Panel B. Indian Ocean slave trade





(coef = -.118, s.e. = .025, N = 52, R2 = .31)

TABLE III						
RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN SLAVE EXPORTS AND	INCOME					

Dependent variable is log real per capita GDP in 2000 $\ln y$

	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)	(6)	
ln(exports/area)	-0.112***	-0.076***	-0.108***	-0.085**	-0.103***	-0.128***	
-	(0.024)	(0.029)	(0.037)	(0.035)	(0.034)	(0.034)	
Distance from		0.016	-0.005	0.019	0.023	0.006	
equator		(0.017)	(0.020)	(0.018)	(0.017)	(0.017)	
Longitude		0.001	-0.007	-0.004	-0.004	-0.009	
-		(0.005)	(0.006)	(0.006)	(0.005)	(0.006)	
Lowest monthly		-0.001	0.008	0.0001	-0.001	-0.002	
rainfall		(0.007)	(0.008)	(0.007)	(0.006)	(0.008)	
Avg max humidity		0.009	0.008	0.009	0.015	0.013	
		(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.012)	(0.011)	(0.010)	
Avg min		-0.019	-0.039	-0.005	-0.015	-0.037	
temperature		(0.028)	(0.028)	(0.027)	(0.026)	(0.025)	
ln(coastline/area)		0.085^{**}	0.092^{**}	0.095^{**}	0.082^{**}	0.083**	
		(0.039)	(0.042)	(0.042)	(0.040)	(0.037)	
Island indicator				-0.398	-0.150		
				(0.529)	(0.516)		
Percent Islamic				-0.008^{***}	-0.006^{*}	-0.003	
				(0.003)	(0.003)	(0.003)	
French legal origin				0.755	0.643	-0.141	
				(0.503)	(0.470)	(0.734)	
North Africa				0.382	-0.304		
indicator				(0.484)	(0.517)		
ln(gold prod/pop)					0.011	0.014	
					(0.017)	(0.015)	
ln(oil prod/pop)					0.078***	0.088***	
					(0.027)	(0.025)	
ln(diamond					-0.039	-0.048	
prod/pop)					(0.043)	(0.041)	
Colonizer fixed effects	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
Number obs.	52	52	42	52	52	42	
R^2	.51	.60	.63	.71	.77	.80	

Notes. OLS estimates of (1) are reported. The dependent variable is the natural log of real per capita GDP in 2000, ln y. The slave export variable ln(exports/area) is the natural log of the total number of slaves exported from each country between 1400 and 1900 in the four slave trades normalized by land area. The colonizer fixed effects are indicator variables for the identity of the colonizer at the time of independence. Coefficients are reported with standard errors in brackets. ***, **, and * indicate significance at the 1%, 5%, and 10% levels.



	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)			
Second Sta	ge. Dependent v	ariable is log in	come in 200	0, ln y			
ln(exports/area)	-0.208^{***}	-0.201^{***}	-0.286^{*}	-0.248^{***}			
	(0.053)	(0.047)	(0.153)	(0.071)			
	[-0.51, -0.14]	[-0.42, -0.13]	$[-\infty, +\infty]$	[-0.62, -0.12]			
Colonizer fixed effects	No	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Geography controls	No	No	Yes	Yes			
Restricted sample	No	No	No	Yes			
F-stat	15.4	4.32	1.73	2.17			
Number of obs.	52	52	52	42			
First Stage. D	ependent varial	ble is slave expo	rts, ln(expoi	rts/area)			
Atlantic distance	-1.31^{***}	-1.74^{***}	-1.32^{*}	-1.69**			
	(0.357)	(0.425)	(0.761)	(0.680)			
Indian distance	-1.10^{***}	-1.43^{***}	-1.08	-1.57^{*}			
	(0.380)	(0.531)	(0.697)	(0.801)			
Saharan distance	-2.43^{***}	-3.00^{***}	-1.14	-4.08^{**}			
	(0.823)	(1.05)	(1.59)	(1.55)			
Red Sea distance	-0.002	-0.152	-1.22	2.13			
	(0.710)	(0.813)	(1.82)	(2.40)			
F-stat	4.55	2.38	1.82	4.01			
Colonizer fixed effects	No	Yes	Yes	Yes			
Geography controls	No	No	Yes	Yes			
Restricted sample	No	No	No	Yes			
Hausman test (<i>p</i> -value)	.02	.01	.02	.04			
Sargan test (p-value)	.18	.30	.65	.51			

TABLE IV ESTIMATES OF THE RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN SLAVE EXPORTS AND INCOME

Notes. IV estimates of (1) are reported. Slave exports ln(exports/area) is the natural log of the total number of slaves exported from each country between 1400 and 1900 in the four slave trades normalized by land area. The colonizer fixed effects are indicator variables for the identity of the colonizer at the time of independence. Coefficients are reported, with standard errors in brackets. For the endogenous variable ln(exports/area), I also report 95% confidence regions based on Moreira's (2003) conditional likelihood ratio (CLR) approach. These are reported in square brackets. The *p*-value of the Hausman test is for the Wu–Hausman chi-squared test.**, **, and * indicate significance at the 1%, 5%, and 10% levels. The "restricted sample" excludes island and North African countries. The "geography controls" are distance from equator, longitude, lowest monthly rainfall, avg max humidity, avg min temperature, and ln(coastline/area).

Dependent variable: Trust of neighbors	Slave exports (thousands) (1)	Exports/ area (2)	Exports/ historical pop (3)	ln (1 + exports) (4)	ln (1+ exports/ area) (5)	ln (1+ exports/ historical pop) (6)
Estimated coefficient	-0.00068 [0.00014] (0.00015) {0.00013}	$\begin{array}{c} -0.019 \\ [0.005] \\ (0.005) \\ \{0.005\} \end{array}$	$-0.531 \\ [0.147] \\ (0.147) \\ \{0.165\}$	$-0.037 \\ [0.014] \\ (0.014) \\ \{0.015\}$	$\begin{array}{c} -0.159 \\ [0.034] \\ (0.034) \\ \{0.034\} \end{array}$	$\begin{array}{c} -0.743 \\ [0.187] \\ (0.187) \\ \{0.212\} \end{array}$
Individual controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
District controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Country fixed effects	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Number of observations	20,027	20,027	17,644	20,027	20,027	17,644
Number of ethnicities	185	185	157	185	185	157
Number of districts	1,257	1,257	1,214	1,257	1,257	1,214
R^2	0.16	0.16	0.15	0.15	0.16	0.15

TABLE 1—OLS ESTIMATES OF THE DETERMINANTS OF TRUST IN NEIGHBORS

Notes: The table reports OLS estimates. The unit of observation is an individual. Below each coefficient three standard errors are reported. The first, reported in square brackets, is standard errors adjusted for clustering within ethnic groups. The second, reported in parentheses, is standard errors adjusted for two-way clustering within ethnic groups and within districts. The third, reported in curly brackets, is T. G. Conley (1999) standard errors adjusted for two-dimensional spatial autocorrelation. The standard errors are constructed assuming a window with weights equal to one for observations less than five degrees apart and zero for observations further apart. The individual controls are for age, age squared, a gender indicator variable, five living conditions fixed effects, ten education fixed effects, 18 religion fixed effects, 25 occupation fixed effects, and an indicator for whether the respondent lives in an urban location. The district controls include ethnic fractionalization of each district and the share of the district's population that is the same ethnicity as the respondent.

	Trust	Trust	Trust of	Intra-	Inter-
	of	of	local	group	group
	relatives	neighbors	council	trust	trust
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
ln (1+exports/area)	-0.133^{***} (0.037)	-0.159*** (0.034)	-0.111^{***} (0.021)	-0.144^{***} (0.032)	$\begin{array}{c} -0.097^{***} \\ (0.028) \end{array}$
Individual controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
District controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Country fixed effects	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Number of observations	20,062	20,027	19,733	19,952	19,765
Number of ethnicity clusters	185	185	185	185	185
Number of district clusters	1,257	1,257	1,283	1,257	1,255
R^2	0.13	0.16	0.20	0.14	0.11

TABLE 2—OLS ESTIMATES OF THE DETERMINANTS OF THE TRUST OF OTHERS

Notes: The table reports OLS estimates. The unit of observation is an individual. Standard errors are adjusted for two-way clustering at the ethnicity and district levels. The individual controls are for age, age squared, a gender indicator variable, five living conditions fixed effects, ten education fixed effects, 18 religion fixed effects, 25 occupation fixed effects, and an indicator for whether the respondent lives in an urban location. The district controls include ethnic fractionalization in the district and the share of the district's population that is the same ethnicity as the respondent.

***Significant at the 1 percent level.

**Significant at the 5 percent level.

*Significant at the 10 percent level.

Controls in the		Trust of relatives	Trust of neighbors	Trust of local council	Intragroup trust	Intergroup trust
restricted set	Controls in the full set	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)	(5)
None None	Full set of controls from equation (1) Full set of controls from equation (1), ethnicity-level colonial controls, and colonial population density	4.31 11.54	4.23 6.98	3.03 2.65	4.13 9.22	3.32 3.80
Age, age squared, gender	Full set of controls from equation (1)	4.17	3.99	2.89	3.91	3.12
Age, age squared, gender	Full set of controls from equation (1), ethnicity-level colonial controls, and colonial population density	10.93	6.52	2.57	8.44	3.59

TABLE 4—USING SELECTION ON OBSERVABLES TO ASSESS THE BIAS FROM UNOBSERVABLES

Notes: Each cell of the table reports ratios based on the coefficient for $\ln (1 + \exp \sigma t_s/area)$ from two individuallevel regressions. In one, the covariates include the "restricted set" of control variables. Call this coefficient β^R . In the other, the covariates include the "full set" of controls. Call this coefficient β^F . In both regressions, the sample sizes are the same, and country fixed effects are included. The reported ratio is calculated as: $\beta^F/(\beta^R - \beta^F)$. See Table 3 for the description of the full set of controls from equation (1), the ethnicity-level colonial controls, and colonial population density.

	Trust of relatives (1)	Trust of neighbors (2)	Trust of local council (3)	Intragroup trust (4)	Intergroup trust (5)
Second stage: Dependent variable	is an individual's	strust			
ln (1+exports/area)	-0.190^{***}	-0.245^{***}	-0.221^{***}	-0.251^{***}	-0.174^{**}
	(0.067)	(0.070)	(0.060)	(0.088)	(0.080)
Hausman test (<i>p</i> -value) R^2	0.88	0.53	0.09	0.44	0.41
	0.13	0.16	0.20	0.15	0.12
First stage: Dependent variable is 1	n(1 + exports/a)	rea)			
Historical distance of ethnic group from coast	-0.0014^{***}	-0.0014^{***}	-0.0014^{***}	-0.0014^{***}	-0.0014^{***}
	(0.0003)	(0.0003)	(0.0003)	(0.0003)	(0.0003)
Colonial population density	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Ethnicity-level colonial controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Individual controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
District controls	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Country fixed effects	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Number of observations	16,709	16,679	15,905	16,636	16,473
Number of clusters	147 / 1,187	147 / 1,187	146 / 1,194	147 / 1,186	147 / 1,184
F-stat of excl. instrument	26.9	26.8	27.4	27.1	27.0
R^2	0.81	0.81	0.81	0.81	0.81

TABLE 5—IV ESTIMATES OF THE EFFECT OF THE SLAVE TRADE ON TRUST

Notes: The table reports IV estimates. The top panel reports the second-stage estimates, and the bottom panel reports first-stage estimates. Standard errors are adjusted for two-way clustering at the ethnicity and district levels. The individual controls, district controls, ethnicity-level colonial controls, and colonial population density measures are described in Table 3. The null hypothesis of the Hausman test is that the OLS estimates are consistent.

***Significant at the 1 percent level.

**Significant at the 5 percent level.

*Significant at the 10 percent level.

TABLE 7—REDUCED FORM RELATIONSHIP BETWEEN THE DISTANCE FROM THE COAST AND TRUST WITHIN AFRICA AND ASIA

	Trust of local government council			
	Afrobarometer sample		Asiabarometer sample	
	(1)	(2)	(3)	(4)
Distance from the coast	0.00039***	0.00031***	-0.00001	0.00001
	(0.00009)	(0.00008)	(0.00010)	(0.00009)
Country fixed effects	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes
Individual controls	No	Yes	No	Yes
Number of observations	19,913	19,913	5,409	5,409
Number of clusters	185	185	62	62
R^2	0.16	0.18	0.19	0.22

Notes: The table reports OLS estimates. The unit of observation is an individual. The dependent variable in the Asiabarometer sample is the respondent's answer to the question: "How much do you trust your local government?" The categories for the answers are the same in the Asiabarometer as in the Afrobarometer. Standard errors are clustered at the ethnicity level in the Afrobarometer regressions and at the location (city) level in the Asiabarometer and the WVS samples. The individual controls are for age, age squared, a gender indicator, education fixed effects, and religion fixed effects.

***Significant at the 1 percent level.

**Significant at the 5 percent level.

*Significant at the 10 percent level.